

GLREA Energy Fair 2009

UPDATE

The MICHIGAN COAL RUSH

Tom Karas

Michigan Energy Alternatives Project

Interlochen, MI logman39@hotmail.com







2007 – 8 potential coal plant proposals

- Consumers Power – Bay City
- Wolverine Electric Cooperative – Rogers City
- Holland Department of Public Works
- Northern Michigan University – Marquette
- LS/Dynegy Power – Midland
- Lansing Board of Water and Light
- Tondu Energy - Manistee
- Mid-Michigan Energy Park - Alma



2008-9 – 4 Proposals went through DEQ Air permitting

- Consumers Power – Bay City
- Wolverine Electric Cooperative –
Rogers City
- Northern Michigan University –
Marquette
- Holland Department of Public Works

2008 – 1 permit issued, 3 under study

- Northern Michigan University received a permit to install from the DEQ. That permit was successfully challenged by the Sierra Club at the EPA level.
- NMU has since changed course and decided **against** constructing a coal fired power plant.

A photograph showing several tall, cylindrical industrial smokestacks. Each stack is emitting a thick, white plume of smoke that rises into the sky. The sky is a clear, deep blue. The smokestacks are positioned at various angles, creating a sense of depth. The overall scene depicts industrial activity and air pollution.

That leaves Michigan with just 3 coal proposals to deal with. From 8 to 4 to 3, we are following the national average where 99 of 150 coal plant proposals have been rejected or withdrawn.

2009 Granholm's State of the State

February 3, 2009, Governor Granholm announces a new executive directive that asks for additional review items for coal fired power plants that are under permit application.

The new areas of evaluation are:

- Are there **feasible and prudent alternatives** to coal fired power plants.
- Is there really a **need** for new power supply?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTIVE No. 2009 - 2

- the Department of Environmental Quality shall determine whether there is a **feasible and prudent alternative** consistent with the reasonable requirements of the public health, safety, and welfare that would **better protect the air, water, and other natural resources** of this state from pollution than the proposed coal-fired electricity generating plant



EXECUTIVE DIRECTIVE No. 2009 - 2

- the Department **shall first determine** whether a reasonable electricity generation need exists in this state that would be served by the proposed coal-fired electricity generating plant.

If a reasonable electricity generation need exists in this state, the Department shall **estimate the extent** of the reasonable electricity generation need.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTIVE No. 2009 - 2

- The Department shall next consider alternative methods of meeting the reasonable electricity generation need, in
 - 1. Constructing new electricity generating resources that use technologies **other than the burning of coal** or that generate electricity from coal using technologies that **reduce or sequester emissions**.
 - 2. **Reducing electricity demand** and peak demand through **energy efficiency programs** or load management techniques.
 - 3. Generating or purchasing electricity from **existing** electricity generating resources.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTIVE No. 2009 - 2

- . If the Department determines that a **feasible and prudent alternative** to the construction of a new proposed coal-fired electricity generating plant exists **that would better protect** the air, water, and other natural resources of this state than the proposed coal-fired electricity generating plant, the Department **shall not issue** a permit to install.



Karas' summary...

- 1. Make sure you need new power. If there really is a need, get a firm grip on the amount.
- 2. Are there better ways to generate it than a traditional coal fired power facility?

The great thing is that this review, in theory, creates a real head to head comparison of fossil fuel based electricity and renewable and energy efficiency options, what a concept! However...

Present day situation

- Governor's directive creates filing of an **Electric Generation Alternatives Analysis**
- So far, Consumers Power and Wolverine Electric Cooperative have sent in analysis for review. On June 5th and June 8th these reports were delivered and a public comment and review period began.
- Consumers Power report was 52 pages and Wolverine's was over 500, but neither contained rock solid research to work with.

For example:

- Consumers Power gave opinions but failed in providing data in 37 areas prompting environmental groups to constantly ask for...
- a. A detailed description of the “**detailed computer modeling techniques and risk analysis**” on which the EGAA is based.
- b. The **input and output data files**, in electronic txt format, for the computer modeling and risk analyses on which the EGAA is based.

And for the Wolverine report...

- Again, scant details backed up the claims or financial equations used to determine how the coal plant was justifiable.
- Coal Prices are just one area of disagreement. Wolverine claims coal being available at one price, but will not show a contract or any type of guarantee for that cost projection. One analyst laughed that Wolverine felt we would believe they could get Wyoming coal cheaper than coal plants in Colorado!

Again, where are the facts that support this opinion...

- “While natural gas, wind, and solar generation options offer lower emission rates, each of these options would also carry a prohibitive cost burden compared to the Rogers City project’s cost of power.”

Did anyone ask you what prohibitive was to your house? How much less or more would you be willing to pay for cleaner electricity? The point is Wolverine will not describe ‘prohibitive’.

They expect us to just trust them?

Where to get information.....

- www.michigan.gov/dleg
- Search for Wolverine Power EGAA
- Search for Consumers Energy EGAA

- Michigan Land Use Institute

www.MLUI.org

for background information on the Michigan Coal Rush.

How to get involved...



www.CleanEnergyNowMI.org

You can e-mail your comments into both the DEQ and MPSC from this site for both the Consumers Power and Wolverine Power Cooperative filings. Comment forms and suggestions are available, or do your own research and send in your unique comments on these questionable filings.

THANKS

- Enjoy the Great Lakes Renewable Energy Fair
 - Tom Karas
- Michigan Energy Alternatives Project
 - logman39@hotmail.com